Sebagai syarat utama pengusul mengajukan artikel dengan judul Pilot Study of a Brief Hypnotic Induction: Effects on Blood Pressure, Heart Rate, and Subjective Distress in Patients Diagnosed with Hypertension yang telah terpublikasi di International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis.

Link Jurnal:

https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/00207144.2022.2004544?journalCode=nhyp20

Link artikel juga tersedia di pubmed gov dengan link:

https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/34875965/

Doi: https://doi.org/10.1080/00207144.2022.2004544

Link pengindeks: https://www.scimagojr.com/journalsearch.php?q=26550&tip=sid&clean=0

Jurnal telah terindex Q2 dengan SJR 0.44

Artikel pada jurnal tersebut merupakan closed access, di halaman hanya tersedia abstrak, untuk mengunduh fulltext dengan berbayar. Abstrak artikel di jurnal tersebut telah diterjemahkan ditiga Bahasa Internasional selain Bahasa Inggris.

Artikel telah melewati proses review yang panjang. Berikut prosesnya:

Hasil review pertama:

From: IJCEH@baylor.edu

To: afkarfadholi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis - Decision on Manuscript ID HYP-2020-0069

Body: 29-Dec-2020

Dear Mr. Upoyo,

Your manuscript entitled "The effect of audio hypnotherapy on blood pressure, heart rate and stress levels in hypertensive patients" has been reviewed. The reviewer and editor comments are included at the bottom of this letter.

The reviewers and myself would like to see some revisions made to your manuscript before further consideration. The topic is of interest. However, as noted by the reviewers, there are numerous major weaknesses that are detailed below. The manuscript will need major revision prior to further consideration. I invite you to respond to each comment and revise your manuscript accordingly.

To start the revision, please click on the link below:

NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijceh?URL MASK=7310f293686e4a0398e83bfbb6002214

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript. Please enter your responses to the comments made by the reviewers in the space provided. **Be as specific as possible in your response by including a point-by-point reply to each reviewer comment.**

IMPORTANT: Revise the manuscript using track changes mode in MS Word or by using colored text to highlight what changes were made.

This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. Your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center. Please delete any redundant files before completing the re-submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis. I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely,
Dr. Gary Elkins
Editor, International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis

Reviewers' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

The paper deals with the different effects of simple relaxation and audio hypnotherapy on heart rate, sistolic and diastolic blood pressure, subjective reports of stress. This is an interesting topic, but the manuscript requires a thoughtful revision. In particular 1) the abstract and Discussion should be completely re-written after having 2) changed the Introduction, 3) clarified the Methods and 4) corrected the Results

Introduction

- a) please clarify what authors intend by writing that hypertension induces stress (in a reciprocal interaction). Do they refer to the endothelial stress leading to increased vascular resistance?. Please clarify and report appropriate references
- b) lines 26-52 are quite general and do not contribute to a reference frame for the study. Please report specific literature on hypertension and hypnotizability /hypnosis rather than generic , questionable description of the hypnotic response

Methods

- c) please describe the experimental procedure in details. Inclusion and exclusion criteria are not enough to understand the methodological approach used. Please clarify the content of the audio tape etc etc, the time of the day and the conditions in which the procedure was applied, d) please indicate whether normality assessment was performed on data distributions before
- using t tests, and adopt non parametric analyses in case of deviations from normality e) please use Bonferroni correction for multiple variables, as heart rate, sistolic and diastolic blood pressure cannot be considered independent variables. By doing this, the level of
- f) in case of nornmal distributions, please consider to use repeated measures ANOVA with 2 a groups (experimental, control) \times 2 times (before, after treatment) experimental design

Results

significance becomes p=0.016

After Bonferroni correction, the results will be different from those reported in the original version of the paper.

Discussion

This section can be considered after the revision of the other sections. I see, at the moment, however, that it includes lines which should be displaced in the Introduction

Reviewer: 2

It is clear from the introduction that this study addresses a very important issue. The manuscript describes a study that explores the effect of hypnotherapy on high blood pressure and stress levels. 64 subjects participated in the study, half of which in the intervention group and the other half in the control group. The intervention group was exposed to hypnotherapy one time only. Blood pressure and stress level was measured before and after intervention. The control group was asked to rest for the same period of time and their blood pressure and stress level was also measured before and after the rest period. Results showed a significant reduction in systolic blood pressure and stress levels compared to the control group. Authors conclude that audio hypnotherapy is effective in controlling systolic blood pressure and stress levels.

Although the acute reduction of systolic blood pressure is beneficial, I believe that the study fails to answer a very important question, whether or not hypnotherapy has long lasting effects in reducing blood pressure and anxiety levels.

On a minor note I think the description of hypnosis and hypnotherapy could be improved. Moreover, I think the introduction needs more information on hypnosis and high blood pressure. On more general terms, the introduction could use more information on the relationship between hypnosis and the autonomic nervous system. Furthermore, I believe that controlling for hypnotizability could have improved the study. Additionally, it is very important to report the statistical tests used. The authors failed to properly report their statistics.

Comments from the editor:

The topic is of interest, but the manuscript will need major revision prior to further consideration. In submitting a revised manuscript, the authors must provide a cover letter detailing the response to each comment in order and detail how it has been addressed in the manuscript. The revised manuscript and associated documents should be in track changes.

Specific concerns are detailed here:

Tables can be removed from the main text and only submitted in the separate document.

Title page

The title page should be consistent with APA style and provide author affiliations, remove academic degrees, and provide specific information on corresponding author address as well as email.

In addition, the title needs to be revised to not begin with the word "The". The title could be improved to more clearly state: A pilot study of a brief hypnotic induction effects on blood pressure, heart rate, and subjective distress in patients diagnosed with Hypertension.

Abstract

As noted by Reviewer #2, the abstract and Discussion must be completely re-written after having changed the Introduction, clarified the Methods and corrected the Results. The abstract will need a complete revision to be consistent with a revised manuscript addressing all of the critiques. The revised abstract should be in track changes as well as the entire revision.

Introduction

- 1. The literature review is inadequate. The paper does not review any prior research on hypnosis interventions (or related therapies such as relaxation, biofeedback, imagery) for hypertension. This is essential to provide an review of prior research and how the current study advances scientific knowledge.
- 2. The introduction should provide a rationale or conceptional framework for how the hypnosis

intervention may affect hypertension.

3. The introduction currently includes many erroneous statements about hypnosis interventions that should be removed. In particular the paragraph beginning with "Hypnotherapy is given thought language...." It is unclear as to how this paragraph contributes to the introduction and may be deleted entirely or with major revision.

Method

In addition to Reviewer #2 critiques,

- 1. The method section should be revised to provide subheadings: Participants, Measures, Hypnosis Intervention, Control Intervention.
- 2. The Participants section should detail how participants were recruited, informed consent obtained, inclusion and exclusion criteria, and how randomization was achieved.
- 3. The Measures sub-section should list each measure and provide reliability and validity data and identify what measures were used (please refer to APA style for manuscripts).
- 4. The hypnosis intervention and the control intervention need more detail provided. Where did the control participants rest and what environmental context? Include any instructions that were given to the control participants. The hypnosis intervention requires more detail to allow for replication. The addition of transcript of the audio recording could be included as an appendix.
- 5. The data analysis does not properly report the statistics (see reviewer comments). The data analysis should report demographics, comparison of the two groups pre-, and comparison of the two groups post. No pre-post analysis within groups should be reported.

Results

The results section needs to be revised consistent with the comments regarding data analysis. This will simplify the results section.

Discussion

The discussion section should summarize the findings of the present study in the context of prior research. Given the comments above, this section will need major revision (please use track changes). Also, the limitations (See also comments of Reviewer #2) should be detailed including: small sample size, brief duration of intervention does not inform long-term benefits, lack of measurement of hypnotizability, reliance on a simple subjective rating of stress.

References

It is essential that all references be in correct APA style. The references will need careful revision to be in complete consistency with APA format. There are numerous errors (e.g., journal titles should not be abbreviated, DOI's should be links: "https://doi.org/10...") in the references section as well as missing information (e.g. issue numbers) for many of the references.

Date Sent: 29-Dec-2020

Hasil review kedua

From: IJCEH@baylor.edu

To: afkarfadholi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis - Decision on Manuscript ID HYP-

2020-0069.R1

Body: 25-Feb-2021

Dear Mr. Upoyo,

Thank you for re-submitting your manuscript. However, the revision submitted did not follow these instructions, so it is not clear what changes were made. You are invited to again revise and resubmit the paper. The next re-submission must follow the instructions for further consideration.

With the re-submission, there was no letter with response including a point-by-point reply to each reviewer comment and the revised manuscript submitted is not in track changes. Also, it is noteworthy that there remain many errors in the manuscript and references, and the transcript submitted should be translated to English.

The previous letter from the Editor provided clear instructions to the authors to: "Enter responses to the comments made by the reviewers in the space provided. **Be as specific as possible in your response by including a point-by-point reply to each reviewer comment.**" and to "Revise the manuscript using track changes mode in MS Word or by using colored text to highlight what changes were made."

For your reference, at the end of this email I am including the original comments from reviewers and editor that were sent in December. Each comment must be responded to.

To start the revision, please click on the link below:

(NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm)

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijceh?URL_MASK=6136a3d2c5224a88a5fc8e94b9f62d4e

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript. Please enter your responses to the comments made by the reviewers in the space provided. *Be as specific as possible in your response by including a point-by-point reply to each reviewer comment.*

IMPORTANT: Revise the manuscript using track changes mode in MS Word or by using colored text to highlight what changes were made.

This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. Your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center. Please delete any redundant files before completing the re-submission.

Sincerely, Dr. Gary Elkins

Editor, International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis

Original comments from reviewers and editor (Originally sent on: 29-Dec-2020)

Reviewers' Comments to Author:

Reviewer: 1

The paper deals with the different effects of simple relaxation and audio hypnotherapy on heart rate, sistolic and diastolic blood pressure, subjective reports of stress. This is an interesting topic, but the manuscript requires a thoughtful revision. In particular 1) the abstract and Discussion should be completely re-written after having 2) changed the Introduction, 3) clarified the Methods and 4) corrected the Results

Introduction

- a) please clarify what authors intend by writing that hypertension induces stress (in a reciprocal interaction). Do they refer to the endothelial stress leading to increased vascular resistance?. Please clarify and report appropriate references
- b) lines 26-52 are quite general and do not contribute to a reference frame for the study.

Please report specific literature on hypertension and hypnotizability /hypnosis rather than generic , questionable description of the hypnotic response

Methods

- c) please describe the experimental procedure in details. Inclusion and exclusion criteria are not enough to understand the methodological approach used. Please clarify the content of the audio tape etc etc, the time of the day and the conditions in which the procedure was applied, d) please indicate whether normality assessment was performed on data distributions before using t tests, and adopt non parametric analyses in case of deviations from normality e) please use Bonferroni correction for multiple variables, as heart rate, sistolic and diastolic blood pressure cannot be considered independent variables. By doing this, the level of significance becomes p=0.016
- f) in case of nornmal distributions, please consider to use repeated measures ANOVA with 2 a groups (experimental, control) \times 2 times (before, after treatment) experimental design

Results

After Bonferroni correction, the results will be different from those reported in the original version of the paper.

Discussion

This section can be considered after the revision of the other sections. I see, at the moment, however, that it includes lines which should be displaced in the Introduction

Reviewer: 2

It is clear from the introduction that this study addresses a very important issue. The manuscript describes a study that explores the effect of hypnotherapy on high blood pressure and stress levels. 64 subjects participated in the study, half of which in the intervention group and the other half in the control group. The intervention group was exposed to hypnotherapy one time only. Blood pressure and stress level was measured before and after intervention. The control group was asked to rest for the same period of time and their blood pressure and stress level was also measured before and after the rest period. Results showed a significant reduction in systolic blood pressure and stress levels compared to the control group. Authors conclude that audio hypnotherapy is effective in controlling systolic blood pressure and stress levels.

Although the acute reduction of systolic blood pressure is beneficial, I believe that the study fails to answer a very important question, whether or not hypnotherapy has long lasting effects in reducing blood pressure and anxiety levels.

On a minor note I think the description of hypnosis and hypnotherapy could be improved. Moreover, I think the introduction needs more information on hypnosis and high blood pressure. On more general terms, the introduction could use more information on the relationship between hypnosis and the autonomic nervous system. Furthermore, I believe that controlling for hypnotizability could have improved the study. Additionally, it is very important to report the statistical tests used. The authors failed to properly report their statistics.

Comments from the editor:

The topic is of interest, but the manuscript will need major revision prior to further consideration. In submitting a revised manuscript, the authors must provide a cover letter detailing the response to each comment in order and detail how it has been addressed in the manuscript. The revised manuscript and associated documents should be in track changes.

Specific concerns are detailed here:

Tables can be removed from the main text and only submitted in the separate document.

Title page

The title page should be consistent with APA style and provide author affiliations, remove academic degrees, and provide specific information on corresponding author address as well as email.

In addition, the title needs to be revised to not begin with the word "The". The title could be improved to more clearly state: A pilot study of a brief hypnotic induction effects on blood pressure, heart rate, and subjective distress in patients diagnosed with Hypertension.

Abstract

As noted by Reviewer #2, the abstract and Discussion must be completely re-written after having changed the Introduction, clarified the Methods and corrected the Results. The abstract will need a complete revision to be consistent with a revised manuscript addressing all of the critiques. The revised abstract should be in track changes as well as the entire revision.

Introduction

- 1. The literature review is inadequate. The paper does not review any prior research on hypnosis interventions (or related therapies such as relaxation, biofeedback, imagery) for hypertension. This is essential to provide an review of prior research and how the current study advances scientific knowledge.
- 2. The introduction should provide a rationale or conceptional framework for how the hypnosis intervention may affect hypertension.
- 3. The introduction currently includes many erroneous statements about hypnosis interventions that should be removed. In particular the paragraph beginning with "Hypnotherapy is given thought language...." It is unclear as to how this paragraph contributes to the introduction and may be deleted entirely or with major revision.

Method

In addition to Reviewer #2 critiques,

- 1. The method section should be revised to provide subheadings: Participants, Measures, Hypnosis Intervention, Control Intervention.
- 2. The Participants section should detail how participants were recruited, informed consent obtained, inclusion and exclusion criteria, and how randomization was achieved.
- 3. The Measures sub-section should list each measure and provide reliability and validity data and identify what measures were used (please refer to APA style for manuscripts).
- 4. The hypnosis intervention and the control intervention need more detail provided. Where did the control participants rest and what environmental context? Include any instructions that were given to the control participants. The hypnosis intervention requires more detail to allow for replication. The addition of transcript of the audio recording could be included as an appendix.
- 5. The data analysis does not properly report the statistics (see reviewer comments). The data analysis should report demographics, comparison of the two groups pre-, and comparison of the two groups post. No pre-post analysis within groups should be reported.

Results

The results section needs to be revised consistent with the comments regarding data analysis. This will simplify the results section.

Discussion

The discussion section should summarize the findings of the present study in the context of prior research. Given the comments above, this section will need major revision (please use track changes). Also, the limitations (See also comments of Reviewer #2) should be detailed including: small sample size, brief duration of intervention does not inform long-term benefits,

lack of measurement of hypnotizability, reliance on a simple subjective rating of stress.

References

It is essential that all references be in correct APA style. The references will need careful revision to be in complete consistency with APA format. There are numerous errors (e.g., journal titles should not be abbreviated, DOI's should be links: "https://doi.org/10...") in the references section as well as missing information (e.g. issue numbers) for many of the references.

Date Sent: 25-Feb-2021

Hasil review ketiga

From: IJCEH@bavlor.edu

To: afkarfadholi@gmail.com

Subject: International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis - Decision on Manuscript ID HYP-2020-0069.R2

Body: 05-Mar-2021

Dear Mr. Upoyo,

I have reviewed your resubmission, and while it is apparent that some changes have been made, very necessary instructions were not followed in the most recent revision and submission.

Specifically:

- 1. The cover paper does not provide a detailed response as to what specific changes and where in the manuscript. Simply stating "I made improvements according to the suggestions" does not provide statement on what specific changes were made.
- 2. Some critique was simply not responded to at all (for example track changes). All critiques must be responded to in the manner noted above, in order.
- 3. The authors have provided a manuscript with some areas highlighted, however this is not track changes. The revision must be in track changes so that it is apparent what has been deleted, added, or changed.
- 4. The authors have made some changes and highlighted the references. However, the references have many errors with numerous references not in current APA style. This should be corrected, in track changes, in the resubmission.
- 5. The transcript was not translated into English, as instructed.

As previously noted, the instructions to authors in the letter must be followed for further consideration.

To start the revision, please click on the link below:

NOTE: This is a two-step process. After clicking on the link, you will be directed to a webpage to confirm.

https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijceh?URL_MASK=0b7cc38ffc3e43879142830d6cc88ecf

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript. Please enter your responses to the editor's comments above in the space provided on that page. **Be as specific as possible in your response by including a point-by-point reply to each reviewer comment.**

IMPORTANT: Revise the manuscript using track changes mode in MS Word to highlight what changes were made.

This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. Your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center. Please delete any redundant files before completing the re-submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis.

Sincerely, Dr. Gary Elkins

Editor, International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis

Date Sent: 05-Mar-2021

Hasil review keempat:

From: IJCEH@baylor.edu

To: afkarfadholi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis - Decision on Manuscript ID HYP-

2020-0069.R3

Body: 12-Mar-2021

Dear Mr. Upoyo,

Thank you for re-submitting your manuscript. I am attaching a document with tracked changes that I have made. The minor edits are suggested wording changes and sentence deletions. You may consider your paper accepted pending the minor revisions listed below and approval of the changes on the attached document.

The following 3 items are required in order for the paper to be accepted. Please read the following carefully:

- 1) To click through each tracked change and accept them, go to the Review tab in Microsoft Word, and where it says "changes" you can click "next" to view each changes and "accept" to approve them.
- 2) The appendix/script should be online-only supplemental material and not a part of the print article. Please mention in your methods section that the script is available online as a supplemental document (it will be made available at the publisher's website).
- 3) I suggest minor changes to the title to make it more professional. Please remove "A" from the beginning, add a colon (:) after "induction", and then ensure that only "Pilot" and "Effects" are capitalized. These changes should be made on the title page, the main document, and within the ScholarOne system when you re-submit the paper. The title in ScholarOne can only be changed within the upload system, so please fix when re-submitting. This is what the title should look like: "Pilot study of a brief hypnotic induction: Effects on blood pressure, heart rate, and subjective distress in patients diagnosed with hypertension"

Please work only from the attached, updated document when making any additional changes. When you submit the revision, you may accept any previous changes and submit a clean copy of the paper.

To submit the revision, please click on the link below: https://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/ijceh?URL MASK=f418cad8082f4e9aad9d4d051bd0083d

This will direct you to the first page of your revised manuscript. You can use the space provided to reply to any additional comments. This link will remain active until you have submitted your revised manuscript. If you begin a revision and intend to finish it at a later time, please note that your draft will appear in the "Revised Manuscripts in Draft" queue in your Author Center. Your original files are available to you when you upload your revised manuscript. Please delete any redundant files before completing the submission.

Once again, thank you for submitting your manuscript to the International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis and I look forward to receiving your revision.

Sincerely, Dr. Gary Elkins

Editor, International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis

Date Sent: 12-Mar-2021

File 1: <u>-2--Editors-revisions-Manuscript-arif-setyo-upoyo-Revision3.docx</u>

Hasil review kelima

From: IJCEH@baylor.edu

To: afkarfadholi@gmail.com

CC:

Subject: International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis - Decision on Manuscript ID

HYP-2020-0069.R4

Body: 17-Mar-2021

Re: "Pilot study of a brief hypnotic induction: Effects on blood pressure, heart rate, and subjective distress in patients diagnosed with hypertension"

Dear Mr. Upoyo,

The edits which have been made to the manuscript are greatly appreciated. We are pleased to accept your paper in the International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis.

Your paper is in the queue for a future issue of the journal. You may list it as "in press". Our copy editor will be in contact in the coming months if any minor edits are needed, and you will receive proofs in due course.

Thank you for your contribution to the International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis. Congratulations on this acceptance, and we look forward to receiving further submissions from you.

Sincerely,

Dr. Gary Elkins

Editor, International Journal of Clinical and Experimental Hypnosis

Taylor & Francis strives to be compliant with the open access (OA) policies of the major national and international funding bodies. Information about funder compliance and OA policies can be found on our Author Services website. Details of our Green OA policy, including deposit in institutional and subject repositories, can be found on the Sharing your work (http://authorservices.taylorandfrancis.com/sharing-your-work/) page. We recommend that you retain your Accepted Manuscript for this purpose.

Date Sent: 17-Mar-2021

Bukti korespondensi di Web jurnal





